

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
10

11 Kim-Anh Pham,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 Lincoln Benefit Life Company,

15 Defendant.
16

No. 2:23-cv-00561-KJM-DB

ORDER

17 The applications for pro hac vice admission by Katherine L. Villanueva, W. Glenn Merten
18 and Jamie Campisi are pending before the court. On July 26, 2023, this court ordered the
19 attorneys to file declarations in support of their applications. Prior Order, ECF No. 36. The
20 attorneys have timely filed their declarations. *See* ECF Nos. 39–41. The court has reviewed the
21 declarations and finds Mr. Merten and Ms. Campisi have not been regularly employed or
22 regularly engaged in professional activities in California. Additionally, although the court is
23 concerned by the number of matters in which Ms. Villanueva has been admitted pro hac vice in
24 California over the past five years, the court finds she also has not been regularly employed or
25 regularly engaged in professional activities in California at this time.

26 The court has considered the number of matters in which each attorney has appeared as
27 counsel in California, the type of activities the attorneys engaged in, and the extent to which the
28 attorneys physically entered California, appeared or argued before a court in California, signed or

1 filed briefs, and communicated with clients and opposing counsel. *See Finder v. Leprino Foods*
2 *Co.*, No. 13-02059, 2019 WL 6894468, at *4 (E.D. Cal. Dec. 18, 2019); *see also Ang v. Bimbo*
3 *Bakeries USA, Inc.*, No. 13-01196, 2015 WL 1474866, at *3 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2015). The court
4 notes Ms. Villanueva has appeared pro hac vice in thirteen total matters in California in the past
5 five years. *See Villanueva Decl.*, ECF No. 39. But she has not signed or filed briefs, has not
6 physically entered California for most of the matters in which she has been admitted pro hac vice,
7 has appeared in a California court for about half of her cases, and many of the cases in which she
8 has appeared are closed and were closed shortly after commencement. *See Villanueva Decl.*,
9 ECF No. 39. The court also notes the majority of Ms. Villanueva's work has been limited to
10 activities outside of California, including legal research, drafting, and conferring with co-counsel.
11 *Id.* Additionally, her communications with clients have been nonexclusive and have included co-
12 counsel. *Id.*

13 Based on the attorneys' declarations, the court finds they have not been regularly
14 employed or regularly engaged in professional activities in California and hereby **grants** their pro
15 hac vice applications.

16 This order resolves ECF Nos. 31, 32 and 33.

17 IT IS SO ORDERED.

18 DATED: August 10, 2023.

19 
CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE